

Technical Education and Private Vocational Training Policy: Literature Review

Mufida Ali Masoud Abdalla, Jacqueline Tham, Albattat Ahmad

Post Graduate Centre, Management and Science University, University Drive, Off Persiaran Olahraga, Section 13, 40100, Selangor, Malaysia.

Email address: alimufida05 @ gmail.com

Abstract— Educational policy in the field of private education in Libya, there was no fixed and visionary policy. The increase in the number of graduates of technical and technical education without attention to quality indicates the absence of an integrated educational policy to reform education and develop training in previous periods due to the absence of standards and future directions in the making of educational policy. Using literature review, this paper found an urgent need to shape educational policies in general, and TVET education in particular, by using the systems theory of Easton, the defect was identified and the need to activate the role of investors in education and training was found, with the participation of the private sector in education in its multiple forms, whether in partnership or privatizations or by opening educational institutions by private companies, directing them to serve the objectives of educational policy and contribute to lifting the burden on the state. As well as knowing how Libya benefits when compared with Malaysia.

Keywords— Educational policy, Technical Education, Private, Vocational Training, Policy.

I. INTRODUCTION

Successful experiences achieved by some developing countries in human investment and educational wealth policy that if the education is not responsible for the failure that surrounded it is a system that interacts within its material and technical potential, the education policy objectives were not achieved (Salem 2015). UNESCO (2018) also reported that “data on the regulatory of higher education in many Arab countries is very limited, and some private institutions are branches of universities in Europe and North America. The share of the private sector is gradually increasing in several Arab countries, because of public policies aimed at reducing pressure on public institutions on the one hand, and because of market needs on the other (Libya-UNESCO, 2018). The difference between public funding and private funding for higher education was stable and there was not much innovation and reciprocity between them. The pressure on higher education can be reduced through the vocational education system which unfortunately seems to be inferior to the university track (al-Mahariq, 2015).

Hence, it is important to improve technical education and vocational training policies, which is the link between strategies and plans for economic development and attract domestic and foreign investment. Therefore, the role of institutions of higher education is no longer limited to the preservation and transfer of cultural heritage from one generation to another, but it also has a role in serving the

society to seek the facts and face the ongoing changes and contribute to finding solutions to the problems of society and extending the labour markets with qualified human cadres that meet their needs (Report, prospects for human development in changing reality, 2016). Most Arab countries, however, still rank late in the international rankings of quality education. Libya must review its educational policies in general and must keep pace with the challenges and reform the education because it has repercussions on other aspects of the country. The study of (Libyan organization for policy and strategy, 2016). It was stated that theoretically, it is possible to say that the stated policies of the education sector related to the introduction of high-quality educational programs and the provision of innovative technical education. Despite the prettiness of stated goals and policies, Libyan universities and institutes still suffer from radical problems and major challenges facing the sector that make its outputs of a specific value). There are few relationships between these institutions and labour market representatives, and they are the result of individual initiatives by the training framework or institutional managers, which remain unfeasible and lacking in permanence. On the other hand, the absence of training standards (al-Bati, 2014) needs to be upgraded technical and vocational education and training, not only in terms of its importance to finding productive and decent work opportunities but also it is quality and professionalism the development (Report, prospects for human development in changing reality, 2016).

The times are appropriate to explore the importance of TVET lessons so that their own strategies tailored to their context can be formulated to translate large investments into skills development into greater economic and social returns for the individual and the economy. (Manila, 2015) And giving the leaders of private educational institutions the opportunity to participate in the preparation of technical vocational education policy. (Private educational institutions foundations bear a strong civic responsibility to engage in the public decision-making process as public decision making has devolved and decentralized, must give opportunities for private foundations local to influence decisions regarding education policy (Memo, 2019).

This research will address the educational policy according to a comprehensive vision based on the diagnosis of the reality of the policy of education TVET in Libya and the challenges facing compared to Libya The choice of researcher Libya, because are very similar in their composition and composition

society of Arab countries (al-Ghazali, 2017) As well as the period of independence of their independence from colonialism in the same period in which independence of Libya in 1952(al-Mabrouk, 2018), where Libya reached advanced levels in technical education and vocational training and became an example to invest in education and the human element (Sadiq, 2014).

In this research, the emphasis is upon the use of the method of systems analysis as this method contributes to problems by placing them in a general structural context derived from specific content by analysing their components. Because it allows the researcher to select a variety of situations that fit the central dimensions that have theoretical foundations. The method of systematic analysis is, therefore, the best choice for this thesis. In a comparative approach, comparisons allow the person to show differences and similarities (Punternvold, 2017) between the Libyan and Libyan systems in terms of the factors, the stages of education development, the education philosophy, private TEV policy, and the most important problems to try to find a model which to improve and develop the performance of the private education organizations in Libya (Abider, 2016).

II. LITERATURE REVIEW

The Education System

The organization of educational administration in Malaysia is also centralized, but it has coordination between departments and its administrative structure consists of four distinct hierarchical levels, which are: The federal level (central), the Ministry of Education is responsible for transforming the educational policy into educational plans, programs, and projects following national aspirations and objectives, The state level, each of the 14 states in Malaysia has an education department, and it is headed by a Director of Education responsible for the implementation of educational programs, projects and activities in the state, the local Level (District / District Education Offices), the district Education Offices are an extension of the State Department of Education, and it forms the link between the school and the state education department, these offices help oversee the implementation of educational programs, projects and activities in schools in the region, and the procedural level (school), the principal is responsible for professional and administrative leadership in schools, and the principal is assisted by a senior assistant in the day-to-day running of the school, the principal duties include principally managing the school in general, they oversee the implementation of the curriculum following the National Education Policy (Kasman, 2018).

Informal education in Malaysia is lifelong education and participates in government departments concerned with education and training, the Ministry of Education (MOE), the Ministry of Human Resources, the Ministry of Entrepreneurship Development, and the Ministry of Youth and Sports. Not separately, as in the Libyan case, but Libya recently noticed the need to coordinate efforts between the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labour and Rehabilitation. A committee was formed in 2019 to lay the

foundations for joint action and the work is still ongoing (Kasman, 2018).

TVET in Libya

Both countries began to promote private education in the same period in the 80s, which began from 1988 to 1992. However, the inputs to the education policy in Libya regarding the goal of disseminating education and increasing the number of students to study has been accomplished; however, the goal of free education has been hampered by allowing private schools to be opened, this has a positive side reflecting the resilience of the educational policy in adapting to the impact of the volatile economic factor of the dependence of public education on oil revenues. The second factor dealing with social pressure (Abider, 2016). In 2000, a regulation was issued to regulate private education. The decision-maker realized that he made a mistake when he left private education without a policy in line with education goals. In 1998 the number of higher institutes were (255) the universities (56) private universities, technical institutes (103) in the overall of Libya. The General People's Committee for Education decided that the Secretariat of Higher Education 50 shall supervise the private higher education. Basic, secondary, and intermediate education under the supervision of the Secretariat of Education. Abider (2016) pointed out that the problem of motivating workers to manage educational change is one of the most important problems facing the leader of change in the exercise of his functions as it reflects the main challenge of educational leaders. The goal of participatory education is to create a climate of competition with public education, which can be achieved only by the elements of competition, such as the specifications of the school building, and the availability of educational services facilities, sources of teaching and learning, and everything that guarantees the quality and effectiveness of quantity and quality (Abider, 2016).

The number of students in the spring of 2019 (39650) but students of higher education about (12,900) male and female (Al-Taeb, 2020). There is a shortage of intermediate technical institutes from (013) in 1998 to (47) 2019 and an increase in schools that teach secondary education. When comparing the number of institutions, we find an increase from (491) institutions in 1998 to (980) institutions in 2019 (Al-Taeb, 2020), that the decline in the average number of technical institutes that provide technical employment has led to an increase in the demand for expatriate workers, and therefore it is necessary to develop an educational policy that balances the number of institutions and specializations according to what the labour market requires. The above research showed that most Arab governments are more interested in building educational buildings than in improving the inputs of the educational process triangle, which is one of the reasons for the failure to link educational policy with the internal environment as well as providing an enabling environment for investors in education (Perrot, 2017).

Malaysia started the executive procedures of the educational policy for technical education for obvious reasons and began to specialize first, the aim was to use the resources of the State to serve education as well as the available

possibilities. The privatization did not mean the withdrawal of the state from public activity, rather, it transforms the role of the state to be able to plan to ensure the functioning of capital projects within the framework of national objectives (Awalluddin, 2019). The Libya policy of education did not examine the specificity of private education and did not establish holding capacity, nor for how to take the exams, no rules were set to motivate faculty members to preserve their rights and allow for a better teaching effort, there have been many violations in terms of educational attainment and equipment, because when it used private technical and vocational education, it entered as a parallel education for public secondary education, there has been an arbitrary separation of academic general education and public and private technical and vocational education (Elferjani, 2015).

The study of Kasman (2018) found that the relationship between educational policy and educational reform is interrelated, and the Malaysian experience in educational reform is the best witness, and he even saw a distinction where Malaysia's reforms in educational policies reflected on the outcomes of education and the country as a whole. Malaysia's steady economic growth was only a clear reflection of its investment in manpower, and it has succeeded in establishing a strong educational system that has helped it meet the need for a skilled workforce, the success of Malaysia's educational policies has led the economy to accumulate substantial human capital, which is the pillar and core of development, Malaysia has used the education as a critical tool to reach the stage based of an information and communication technology economy (Kasman, 2018). The hierarchy can be observed in policies, and this does not necessarily negate the failures that can be addressed, so the 2013-2025 plan was to address the shortcomings in the highly skilled, creative, and innovative workforce of TVET required by the labour market. The following table shows the effectiveness and efficiency of the education policy between Libya and Malaysia.

TABLE 1. World Bank 2015 GCI

Global Competitiveness Index	Malaysia	Libya	World Reference Index
Overall classification among countries	20	108	184 countries
Transparency of government decision-making	1.40	125	1.12
Enrolment in secondary education	68.5	110.3	5.01
Post-secondary enrolment quality of education	26.1	54.5%	5.02
Salaries and productivity	69	148	5.03
Women in the labour force for men	2880.00	126	7.06
Individuals using the Internet	45%	135	7.10
Ability to innovate	11.62	103	9.04
	12.04	143	12.01

The table shows that the difference between Libya and Malaysia in most indicators, especially the quality and employment of women Malaysia is higher than Libya.

III. RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This paper reviewed the available books, journals, conferences, and official reports, to highlight the importance

of vocational education and training worldwide and find the comparison between Malaysia as developed and enhanced TVET system and Libya. The research highlighted the importance of the strategic national framework and the broad participation of all governmental and private parties concerned with education and vocational and technical training.

IV. FINDING

The importance of investing in teachers at every stage. Libya needs to have high quality and efficient teaching specialists. The qualifications of teachers do not only affect the quality of teaching and thus the performance of students (Subrahmanyam, 2017). Malaysian experience has identified challenges in developing this curriculum that many other education systems also face One of these issues is the balance to achieve a systematic structure that includes unified the policy expectations while meeting the needs of local contexts. Evaluation and examination systems Malaysia stresses the importance of organizing the evaluation system efficiently. Libya can study the Malaysian experience to observe how evaluation can affect the decision-making process related to education by individuals, their families, and employers as users of the system. These strategies include providing their schools with an updated information and communication technology infrastructure and their teachers are trained to use the information and communications technology (Hassan, 2020).

There is a need to reform educational policies because every reform is considered as an indicator of the organization in which it is changing gradually. Partial change is made to adapt the organization with internal and international situations. The reform is gradual from a developmental perspective (Al-Ashhab, 2016). The positive effects of vocational and technical education on community development make it a necessary entry to cope with the growing unemployment among young people in the age group (15-24), which constitute 21.6% of the total population (indicators, 2015). Vocational education is another compliment to academic education for those who have not been fortunate enough in academic education because of the limited ability of some families to educate their children in public and private universities. The greater trend towards academic education and the inferior view of vocational and technical education by the society as a refuge for the failed person (Qadi, 2015)

There are tendencies towards centralizing the management of this system and eliminating some of its disadvantages, despite attempts to decentralize Libya, however, the dominant management style remains central, this is evidenced by the fact that the authority to develop curricula is limited to some organs and councils of the Ministry of Education, without the opportunity to discuss and share the different levels of educational administration (regional, local and schools). Educational systems in various developed and developing countries are now in a cycle of conflict and change resulting from the tremendous advances in science and technology, thus, there have been innovations in the field of education management, which necessitates access to various

international experiences in this area which has resulted from economic, social, cultural, and technical transformations, and the change in attitudes, expectations, and humanitarian needs. The administrative structures and operational methods of many administrative bodies needed to be changed so that it can exercise its activities more efficiently and effectively, including the educational system (Bell-Hajj, 2015).

There is an urgent need to study Asian societies from the educational aspect, this is because most of the studies and research that dealt with these countries focused just on the economic and political aspects but not others, while the focus of some studies and educational research in Libya on the study of Western educational models, which can, in one way or another, call for excellence and advocacy for these models despite the existence of countries worth considering for the progress made by those countries in the progress of their educational systems, among them are Southeast Asian countries. - There are many similarities between Libya and Libya in many aspects, for example, Overpopulation, Islamic religion, comprehensive development and more (Edmonstone, 2019). There is great interest on the part of the Israeli entity to study the Southeast Asian countries and benefit from their scientific and technological progress in return, Israel assists and supports these states militarily (33: 183). If the Zionist entity is interested in the study of these countries, Arab countries should be quick to identify the secrets of the progress of these countries in the field of social and economic development, the role of education in this progress and try to benefit from the experiences and expertise of these countries in this regard.

Abider (2016) says if we look at the dimensions of education in the 21st century we can say that one of the pillars of education is learning to be able to work, which usually involves acquiring skills and linking knowledge to practice, as an essential part of training and qualifying the individual for working life, however, the shift towards a broader knowledge base and the growing role of economic knowledge is forcing educational institutions to give priority to mental skills over manual skills, hence, such new trends in linking educational preparation to work have been imposed by the labour market and working life in its new forms. Productive and service enterprises, especially in developed countries, are assuming that graduates who can be employed and absorbed can contribute to the development of competitiveness, and in providing innovations and creativity to achieve the competitive advantage of the enterprise, and improving production and productivity based mainly on tenure and the application of knowledge.

The new technology does not accelerate the possibilities for the right economic policies and increasing global trade, Abider (2016) stresses that the 21st century will be the era of more rapid changes in knowledge, information, communication, science, technology, manufacturing, and globalization. This process has two important tendencies which are making education professional and the need for vocational education has a human-centred development model. From the above, we note that the development of technical and vocational education in the light of (global

changes) no longer is a luxury and recreation because production is the mainstay of the national economy, which depends mainly on human resources quantitatively, technical and vocational education plays a key role in the preparation of these required human resources to provide the production and service institutions with their different quality branches with cadres working at all levels ranging from the normal worker to the executive worker to the technical supervisor. (Abider, 2016).

In the face of these changes and challenges, it is important to develop the policy of technical and vocational education which defines future directions for the development of this system and to drive its growth towards the desired goals, hence, we note the tendency of States to develop their educational policies to increase the effectiveness of their human resources through several policies that interact with the decisive changes of the times. Whereas the economic and technological changes have led to a new global economy that is characterized by globalization and high speed, therefore, countries face these challenges in the field of competitiveness.

Therefore, countries must acquire knowledge, manage production in order to achieve quality, raise productivity and flexibility quickly with the requirements of a competitive global system, among the technical and vocational education policies is addressing the private response to market forces by encouraging the expansion of vocational and technical education institutions, today's educational policy tends to broaden the concept of vocational and technical education from a limited task of providing industry-specific skills training and special skills for crafts to a broader task of development (human resources) and lifelong learning for sustainable development. To cope with the persistent unemployment situation globally, the education policies tend to be called reverse conversion where many graduates of literary disciplines choose vocational and technical education in technical and community colleges. (Bell-Hajj, 2015).

Comparative education is a theoretical, interdisciplinary, and applied for work. Through it comes the accurate analysis of the cultural context of educational institutions such as the school and the university to identify their mechanisms, method of operation and all their internal aspects, and to link this to the cultural context of everyone and the global context. Of mutual influences between them. The comparison also focuses on the future dimension by emphasizing the processes of educational change and its management and coming up with theories to explain them and predict the success of this change. The comparison also shows the effective implementation of educational policies in different countries by studying the theories of change in educational systems, their difficulties, and obstacles, and how to face them to improve and develop education systems in different countries to achieve international cooperation, concepts, and security.

While emphasizing the need for a variety of methodological approaches in comparative studies to achieve theoretical and practical aspects, for example, most Asian countries focused on the importance of vocational and technical education, based on their political, economic and social considerations, the vocational and technical education is

often seen in Asia as a solution to educational problems, in terms of reducing the pressure on higher education, it also tackles the unemployment of university graduates and stops rural-urban migration. Libya stands out as one of the Southeast Asian countries that are moving to develop its educational policies by developing its human resources for the industry of Libya as a developed country by 2020.

V. CONCLUSION

The general policy of the education system in Libya failed to achieve interdependence with the environment, as for the internal environment, the decline and the explicit orientation towards the horizontal expansion led to the issuance of orders to increase the numbers and of higher education without any attention to quality and harmonization considerations, however, the gap between spending and student numbers has not been reduced if education spending is tracked (its dependent variable of oil revenues), the path of student numbers (its dependent variable of population growth rate) indicates that the upward trend in student growth rates. Offset by a downward trend in growth in education and training spending. This has contributed to deepening the gap between these two tracks. This is naturally reflected in a decline in the efficiency of education and training spending and a decrease in the quality of education outputs.

The trend towards the quantitative expansion of the education system has reduced the flexibility of this system in the recurrent absorption caused by falling oil revenues on the market impact of external shocks. The first step in a multi-structured corporate governance level of education and vocational training in identifying vertical and horizontal aspects of the task of the system (the party's layers of governance and policy education and vocational training who work in different political fields of education and vocational training). This is followed by a description of who - Or what it should be - the stakeholders and a reference to their roles and functions in different areas of policy and practices of education and vocational training, throughout the entire political cycle, working in partnership with other stakeholders. The Solutions must resolve tensions in the roles and responsibilities of different ministries and government agencies by allocating appropriate functions and responsibilities to stakeholders, such solutions must involve public and private stakeholders working together in well-established and innovative partnerships.

REFERENCES

- [1] Abider, J. (2016). Regulatory Policy for Higher Education and the Role of the Private Sector in Libya. *University of East Anglia, PhD, Norwich, and Norfolk, UK*, 35.
- [2] Al Riyami, T., & Al-Issa, A. (2018). Investigating TESOL Teachers' Awareness of Critical Pedagogy at Higher Education Institutions in Oman: Implications for Critical Professional Development.
- [3] Al-Amri, M. O. (2017). Introduction to Comparative Education. Dar Al-Moataz, Jordan, Amman, 260.
- [4] Albertos Azaria, Efthymios Valkanos, Nick Dukakis, (2017) "In-house experiential education after the Greek crisis: recessionary effects on experiential learning design and implementation of an effective vocational training", *Industrial and Commercial Training*, Vol. 49 Issue: 5, pp.256-269, <https://doi.org/10.1108/ICT-04-2017-0029>
- [5] AlFerjany, A. A. M., Salama, A. A., Amuna, Y. M. A., Al Shobaki, M. J., & Naser, S. S. A. (2018). The Relationship between Correcting Deviations in Measuring Performance and Achieving the Objectives of Control-The Islamic University as a Model.
- [6] Ali, D. A. (2017). National Libyan Public Education Reform: Entire Transformative Strategies, 2020-2026. *American Journal of Educational Research*, 7.
- [7] Allen, M. (2017). *The sage encyclopedia of communication research methods (Vols. 1-4)*. Thousand Oaks, CA: SAGE Publications, Inc doi: 10.4135/9781483381411
- [8] Al-Mabrouk, D. (2018). Education in Libya compared to other countries. In *Education in Libya compared to other countries*. Dar Hamether Publishing, Egypt – Cairo, 98.
- [9] Al-Shakshouki, F. A.-H. (2019). Fahima Al-Hadi Al-Shakshouki - The Future of Education and Training in Libya, <https://shakshouki.blogspot.com/2019/04/>, p. <https://shakshouki.blogspot.com/>.
- [10] Annamdevula Subrahmanyam (2017) "Relationship between service quality, satisfaction, motivation and loyalty", *Quality Assurance in Education*, Vol. 25 No. 2, pp. 171-188 DOI: <https://doi.org/10.1108/QAE-04-2013-0016>, Publisher: Emerald Publishing Limited.
- [11] Awadh, A. S., Kreber, C., Donn, G., & Martin, B. (2016). Transnational higher education and quality: Omans experience and the concept of policy borrowing (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). The University of Edinburgh.
- [12] Awalluddin, M. A. (2019). Human Capital Management in Libya: Issues and Strategic Measures. Faculty of Science Administration and Policy Studies, University Technology MARA, Libya, 3.
- [13] Ayonmike, C. S., Okwelle, P. C., & Okeke, B. C. (2015). Towards Quality Technical Vocational Education and Training (Tvet) Programmes in Nigeria: Challenges and Improvement Strategies. *Journal of Education and Learning*, 4(1). doi:10.5539/jel.v4n1p25
- [14] Azman, N., Sirat, M., & Pang, V. (2016). Managing and mobilising talent in Libya: issues, challenges, and policy implications for Libyan universities. *Journal of Higher Education Policy and Management*, 38(3), 316-332.
- [15] Bajunid, I. A. (2019). National Policies, Education Reforms, and Leadership Training and Development: Towards Building a Critical Force of Scholar Leaders in Libya. In *Perspectives on School Leadership in Asia Pacific Contexts* (pp. 149-170). Springer, Singapore.
- [16] Bala, U. (2017). Impact of Oil Price on Inflation, Trade Balance and Economic Growth in African OPEC Member Countries.
- [17] Balhouq, H. S. A. (2018). Vocabulary learning strategies of English majors in Libyan higher education: an analytic survey with special reference to stimulated recall methodology (Doctoral dissertation, Manchester Metropolitan University).
- [18] Bhengu, T. T., Mchunu, B. S., & Bayeni, S. D. (2020). Growing Our Own Timber! Lived Experiences of Five School Principals in Using a Systems Thinking Approach for School Development. *SAGE Open*, 10(1), 2158244020902061.
- [19] Bhushan, S. (2019). Contesting the Present in the Evolution of Public Higher Education. In *The Future of Higher Education in India* (pp. 1-20). Springer, Singapore.
- [20] Birkland, T. A. (2019). An introduction to the policy process: Theories, concepts, and models of public policy making. Routledge.
- [21] Börner, K., Bueckle, A., & Ginda, M. (2019). Data visualization literacy: Definitions, conceptual frameworks, exercises, and assessments. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 116(6), 1857-1864.
- [22] BTI, (2018). Libya Country Report. Accessed 23 March 2020 from <https://www.bti-project.org/en/reports/country-reports/detail/itc/LBY/>
- [23] Bush, T., Bell, L., & Middlewood, D. (Eds.). (2019). *Principles of Educational Leadership & Management*. SAGE Publications Limited.
- [24] Carlucci, D., Lerro, A., & Skaržauskienė, A. (2010). Managing complexity: systems thinking as a catalyst of the organization performance. *Measuring business excellence*.
- [25] Chai, W. M., Lee, C. S., Wong, Y. F., & Yap, K. C. (2018). The paradox of declining female happiness in Libya: a study of gender wage gap (Doctoral dissertation, UTAR).

- [26] Creswell, J.W. (2013) *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. 4th Edition, SAGE Publications, Inc., London.
- [27] Department of Statistics (2020) *Labour force and Social Statistics*. Accessed 23 Mar 2020 from https://www.dosm.gov.my/v1/index.php?r=column/ctwoByCat&parent_id=123&menu_id=U3VPMldoYUxzVzFaYmNkWXZteGduZz09
- [28] Eid, H. (2019). *The Algerian educational system and the development of the values of citizenship among the teachers: A field study in the Sétif state*. the University of Mohamed Lamine Dabagine, Algeria, Algeria PHD, 78.
- [29] Felestin, Triyono, Mochamad, (2015). ‘The implementation of total quality management at vocational high schools in Indonesia’, *Research and Evaluation in Education*, Vol.1, pg 13-24, Doi 10.21831/reid.v1i1.4895
- [30] Ferenczi, S. (2018). *Final contributions to the problems and methods of psychoanalysis*. Routledge.
- [31] Fitori, H. (2019). *Difficulties in teaching and learning English grammar in Libyan universities* (Doctoral dissertation, Liverpool John Moores University).
- [32] Frick, T. W. (2018). *Understanding Systemic Change in Education*. <https://tedfrick.sitehost.iu.edu/siggs1.html>.
- [33] Galguera, M. P. (2018). *Globalization, Mass Education and Technical and Vocational Education and Training: The Influence of UNESCO in Botswana and Namibia* (Vol. 31). Springer.
- [34] George, A. L. (2019). *Case studies and theory development: The method of structured, focused comparison*. In Alexander L. George: *A pioneer in political and social sciences* (pp. 191-214). Springer, Cham.
- [35] Hanushek, E. A. (2020). *Education production functions*. In the *Economics of Education* (pp. 161-170). Academic Press.
- [36] Harari, Y. N. (2018). *21 Lessons for the 21st Century*. Random House.
- [37] Hassan, N. M., & Wohlmuth, K. (2020). *Science, Technology, and Innovation (STI) Policies for Economic Transformation in North Africa—An Introduction*. Science, Technology, and Innovation Policies for Inclusive Growth in Africa: Human Skills Development and Country Cases, 21, 181.
- [38] Hassan, R., Foong, L. M., & Ismail, A. A. (2019). *TVET in Libya*. In *Vocational Education and Training in ASEAN Member States* (pp. 109-132). Springer, Singapore.
- [39] Hbaci, I. A. (2018). *Evaluating Educators’ Competency in the Use of Computer Technology Toward Integrating Technology into Libyan Higher Education*.
- [40] Henry, C., Hill, F., & Leitch, C. (2017). *Educatorship education and training: the issue of effectiveness: the issue of effectiveness*. Routledge.
- [41] Høgmo, A. M. (2018). *Distance Education System Thinking Policy*.
- [42] Hussein, S. (2018). *Factors affecting the implementation of communicative language teaching in Libyan secondary schools* (Doctoral dissertation, Sheffield Hallam University).
- [43] Israel, B. A., Schulz, A. J., Parker, E. A., Becker, A. B., Allen, A. J., Guzman, J. R., & Lichtenstein, R. (2017). *Critical issues in developing and following CBPR principles*. Community-based participatory research for health: Advancing social and health equity, 31-46.
- [44] Jackson, R., Sørensen, G., & Møller, J. (2019). *Introduction to international relations: theories and approaches*. Oxford University Press, USA.
- [45] John Edmonstone (2019) *Is action learning culture bound? An exploration*, *Action Learning: Research and Practice*, DOI: 10.1080/14767333.2019.1627777.
- [46] Jones, A. M. (2017). *Youth education and guidance for employment in Libya: An evolving scenario*. In *Career Guidance and Livelihood Planning across the Mediterranean* (pp. 159-170). Brill Sense.
- [47] Kmiotek-Meier, E., Karl, U., & Powell, J. J. (2018). *Designing the (Most) Mobile University: The Centrality of International Student Mobility in Luxembourg’s Higher Education Policy Discourse*. *Higher Education Policy*, 1-24.
- [48] Knoke, D. (2018). *Changing organizations: Business networks in the new political economy*. Routledge.
- [49] Kouzes, J. M., & Posner, B. Z. (2018). *The student leadership challenge: Five practices for becoming an exemplary leader*. John Wiley & Sons.
- [50] Leonetti, C. (2019). *The Syrian civil war, foreign involvement, and violations of international humanitarian law*.
- [51] Loewen, J. W. (2018). *Teaching what really happened: How to avoid the tyranny of textbooks and get students excited about doing history*. Teachers College Press.
- [52] Magnus Fjellström, Per Kristmansson, (2016) “Learning as an apprentice in Sweden: A comparative study on affordances for vocational learning in school and work life apprentice education”, *Education + Training*, Vol. 58 Issue: 6, pp.629-642, <https://doi.org/10.1108/ET-12-2015-0113>.
- [53] Manning, K. (2017). *Organizational theory in higher education*. Routledge.
- [54] Mansoor, Z., & Williams, M. J. (2018). *Systems approaches to public service delivery: lessons from health, education, and infrastructure*.
- [55] Mchunu, B. S. (2015). *Examining the use of Systems Thinking Approach to School Development: A Case Study of Five Schools in the Umgungundlovu*. PhD, University of Kwazulu-Natal, Durban, South Africa., 21.
- [56] MEMO, (2019). *Middle East Monitor, Libya: teachers go back to work after agreement to raise salaries*. Accessed 24 March 2020 from: <https://www.middleeastmonitor.com/20191202-libya-teachers-go-back-to-work-after-agreement-to-raise-salaries/>
- [57] Menozzi, O., Di Valerio, E., Tamburrino, C., Shariff, A. S., d’Ercole, V., & Di Antonio, M. G. (2017). *A race against time: monitoring the necropolis and the territory of Cyrene and Giarabub through protocols of remote sensing and collaboration with Libyan colleagues*. *Libyan Studies*, 48, 69-103.
- [58] Mezher, R. (2017). *Strategic Management and its Role in Achieving the Quality of Educational and Research Services: A Comparative Field Study between Arab and Foreign Universities*, Suez Canal University, Egypt PhD 2017, p. 57.
- [59] Milovanovic, M. (2018). *Policy Analysis Manual*. European Training Foundation (ETF), 9.
- [60] Mitchell, D., & Sutherland, D. (2020). *What really works in special and inclusive education: Using evidence-based teaching strategies*. Routledge.
- [61] Mohsin, M. I. A., Dafterdar, H., Cizacka, M., Alhabsbi, S. O., Razak, S. H. A., Sadr, S. K., & Obaidullah, M. (2016). *Current Development of Waqf Properties in Selected Countries and Their Socioeconomic Roles*. In *Regulatory the Development of Old Waqf Properties* (pp. 37-220). Palgrave Macmillan, New York.
- [62] Molesworth, M., Nixon, E., & Scullion, R. (2009). *Having, being and higher education: The marketization of the university and the transformation of the student into consumer*. *Teaching in Higher Education*, 14(3), 277-287. doi: 10.1080/13562510902898841
- [63] Ogun, M. N., Yurtsever, S., & Said, A. (2020). *Libya’s Past, Present, and Vision of the Future*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- [64] Parasuraman, A., Zeithaml, V.A. and Berry, L.L. (1988), “SERVQUAL: a multiple-item scale for measuring consumer perceptions of service quality”, *Journal of Retailing*, Vol. 64 No. 1, pp. 12-24.
- [65] Popkewitz, T. S. (Ed.). (2018). *The formation of school subjects: The struggle for creating an American institution*. Routledge.
- [66] Shahijan, M. K., Rezaei, S., & Guptan, V. P. (2018). *Marketing public and private higher education institutions: A total experiential model of international student’s satisfaction, performance and continues intention*. *International Review on Public and Nonprofit Marketing*, 15(2), 205-234.
- [67] Shalem, Y., & De Clercq, F. (2019). *Teacher Development and Inequality in Schools: Do We Now Have a Theory of Change?* In *South African Schooling: The Enigma of Inequality* (pp. 243-261). Springer, Cham.
- [68] Trani, J. F., Fowler, P., Bakhshi, P., & Kumar, P. (2019). *Assessment of progress in education for children and youth with disabilities in Afghanistan: A multilevel analysis of repeated cross-sectional surveys*. *PLoS one*, 14(6).
- [69] Vandewalle, D. (2018). *Libya since independence: oil and state-building*. Cornell University Press.
- [70] Vasiliki Brinia, Petros Stavropoulos, Anastasia Athanasoula-Reppa, (2018) “Trainees’ perception of vocational training institutes degree apprenticeship: An empirical approach”, *Higher Education, Skills and Work-Based Learning*, Vol. 8 Issue: 4, pp.365-375, <https://doi.org/10.1108/HESWBL-10-2017-0074>



- [71] Virtanen, Anne & Tynjälä, Päivi. (2018). Factors explaining the learning of generic skills: a study of university students' experiences. *Teaching in Higher Education*. 1-15. 10.1080/13562517.2018.1515195.
- [72] Waterbury, J. (2019). Reform of Higher Education in the Arab World. In *Major Challenges Facing Higher Education in the Arab World: Quality Assurance and Relevance* (pp. 133-166). Springer, Cham.
- [73] Zimmerman, B.J. (1989), "A social cognitive view of self-regulated academic learning", *Journal of Educational Psychology*, Vol. 81 No. 3, pp. 329-39.